



Goodwill Industries of San Francisco, San Mateo and Marin Counties 2011 Final Report to the California Emerging Technology Fund

Name of Executive Director: Deborah Alvarez-Rodriguez
Name of Project Manager: Ryan Boyle
Manager Phone Number: 415.575.2105
Manager Email: rboyle@sfgoodwill.org
Name of Project: Goodwill ReCompute
Grant Number: 1967452
Start Date: October 2008 **End Date:** June 2011

I. Financial Summary

- Total Project Budget Spent: \$3,001,623.20
- CETF Grant Amount: \$600,000
- Percentage of Match Funds Raised against Goal (\$1,800,000): 150%
- Cost Per Unit of Outcomes: \$212

II. Project Description, Goals and Objectives, and Outcomes

Project Description

Since 2004, Goodwill has operated ReCompute, a computer/electronics recycling program that provides work-based job training to participants with significant barriers to employment. In addition to recycling over 2.5 million pounds of electronics annually, Goodwill refurbishes and distributes hundreds of computers at low cost to underserved individuals throughout San Francisco, San Mateo and Marin County.

The proposed project was to upgrade and expand the capacities of the ReCompute program in the following ways:

- Integrate formal computer technician training and industry certification into the program.
- Increase the number of participants served every year from 4 to 94.
- Offer career assistance and job placement services in ICT positions to all program graduates.
- Provide each program participant with a low-cost computer at a predetermined point during training.
- Increase the number of refurbished computers distributed at low or no cost to underserved residents of San Francisco and San Mateo County to 600 per year.

Another part of the project was that ReCompute participants would be able to complete the program in one or more of three separate training tracks, depending on the job-readiness of the participant, listed below:

Integrated Computer Hardware and Applications Training/ Work-Based Training: Participants will enroll for 7 months in the work-based transitional employment program, working 30 hours per week in the recycling/value recovery operation while concurrently completing 10 hours per week of classroom-based computer hardware and applications training. Participants who successfully complete the course will be awarded IC3 Certification and will either enroll in the Advanced Computer Technician Training Program or seek a job with the assistance of the ReCompute Career Advisor.

Computer Hardware and Applications Training: Participants will complete 220 hours of classroom-based training. Those who successfully complete the course and earn IC3 Certification may choose to enter a career track that requires basic transferable computer skills, with the assistance of the ReCompute Career Advisor or enter the Advanced Computer Technician Training Program.

Advanced Computer Technician Training Program: Participants qualify for the program through completion of the hardware/applications program or by demonstrating proficiency on an assessment test. Upon completion of 330 hours of classroom-based technical instruction, participants will take the exam to earn A+ Certification. They will also complete an internship in retail sales/service, refurbishing, and/or ICT support, either concurrently with the training program or prior to receiving Certification. Upon completion of both the training and internship, participants will enter a career track in computer sales/service or ICT support with the assistance of the ReCompute Career Advisor.

Goodwill will partner with The Stride Center, a reputable community-based provider, on the project. Over the three years of the project, approximately 200 computers will be distributed free of charge to community-based nonprofits serving disadvantaged urban neighborhoods. Some of these computers will be redistributed as free computers to clients and roughly 1,500 computers will be sold at low cost through two ReCompute stores in San Francisco and San Mateo County. Computer sales and service technicians, trained through ReCompute and employed in the internship component of the program, will assist low-income consumers to purchase an affordable computer that matches their needs and technology skill level. All computer purchases will include a warranty supported by ReliaTech outlets located within the ReCompute stores.

Working as part of the EmpowerNet California Collaborative, SFGW would develop tools that job-training programs, including other Goodwill agencies, can use to replicate the program elsewhere.

Goodwill's mission is to create solutions to poverty through the businesses Goodwill operates. This mission statement is grounded in the belief that the market economy is ultimately the solution to poverty and that skilled work is the gateway to the market economy. Goodwill thus has developed a comprehensive set of strategies that equip program participants with the skills and capacities they need to effectively compete in the job marketplace of today.

Adoption of broadband begins with access to computers and digital literacy training. While Goodwill does not provide direct broadband services, it creates stepping stones that customers and participants may use to adopt broadband use in their homes. An investment in this project will help close the digital divide and increase access to broadband for various residents of disadvantaged urban neighborhoods in a number of ways:

- All participants in the ReCompute program, low-income residents of disadvantaged urban neighborhoods in San Francisco and San Mateo County, will gain basic computer skills, including Internet navigation and applications, as well as a refurbished computer. Most participants will also gain technology skills appropriate for ICT employment.
- ReCompute will generate a steady supply of refurbished computers, which Goodwill will make available, at no cost, to nonprofit organizations serving low-income residents of San Francisco and San Mateo County. Goodwill will also sell the refurbished systems at low cost through its ReCompute stores.
- Computer customers will receive a warranty, access to service through the ReliaTech outlet in the Goodwill stores, information about affordable broadband service, and computer literacy training through the materials Goodwill will make available and distribute.
- Program graduates will become community resources for their disadvantaged neighborhoods, offering technical assistance and social support as family members, neighbors, and friends acquire computers and gain basic technology skills.

Strategy to Close the Digital Divide

Of the five technology factors CETF has identified as central to the closing of the Digital Divide, the project's goal was to address three of them:

Affordability: The expanded ReCompute program will refurbish 600 computers every year and distribute them at no or low cost to residents of urban disadvantaged neighborhoods in San Francisco and San Mateo County.

Assistance: Approximately 80% of the refurbished computers produced by the program will be sold in the ReCompute Computer Stores in San Francisco and Redwood City. Program participants who have completed the ReCompute training program will work as interns in computer sales and technical support at the ReCompute Computer Stores, helping low-income residents of disadvantaged neighborhoods select computer systems appropriate to their needs, providing on-the-spot training in computer use, and being available to customers who return to the store for follow-up consultations.

Applications: At the point of sale or distribution of its refurbished computers, Goodwill will distribute printed sheets with information about no- or low-cost computer training classes and low-cost broadband access. ReCompute program graduates will become resources to underserved urban communities – their own – as they offer their technical expertise on an informal basis to family, neighbors, and friends.

In line with the CETF Strategic Action Plan, the project would be a workforce preparation program that will expand and ultimately produce the tools for replication of a successful three-year-old program. ReCompute also focuses on the affordability of hardware and the availability of training and technical support.

Finally, the project plan was to incorporate the best practices identified by the Strategic Plan, including: coordinating computer refurbishing with the training program, training interested participants to provide tech support for residents, and linking trained residents to job opportunities through a consortium of employers.

Goals and Objectives Summary

All goals and objectives have been completed. In all but two cases, Goodwill exceeded targeted outcome levels for the objectives: Goodwill exceeded our target for overall product distribution by 112%, page views for the Teacup website by 215%, and organizations ordering for the first time by 430%.

However, as discussed in the Accomplishments and Lessons Learned section (below), Goodwill did not quite reach its 20% goal for distribution in California (distribution for California is estimated at 15% of total distribution) and the percentage of distributed donated equipment reached 5%, not the targeted 15%. (Unfortunately, much of the donated equipment received was not of high enough quality to be suitable for distribution). These and additional details about the outcome are discussed below.

Project Outcomes Summary

Outcome Description	Actual	Goal	Percentage Completed
Number of jobs obtained by youth and adults in ICT literacy	46	68	68%
Number of adult students that completed basic course work to use the Internet	143	203	70%
Number of adult students that completed course work that prepares them for a job/career	143	203	70%
Number of laptop or desktop systems received for refurbishment (excluding printers)	44,676	12,000	372%
Number of systems refurbished and donated	1,735	1,800	96%
Number of printers received for refurbishment (excluding printers)	0	0	n/a
Number of printers refurbished and donated	0	0	n/a
Has grantee staff attended face-to-face training? (Yes=1, No=0)	2	2	100%
Access plan completed and turned in? (Yes=1, No=0)	1	1	100%

IV. Accomplishments and Challenges

Summary of Accomplishments and Impacts of Project

Assessment of Outcomes Achieved in Comparison to Grant Agreement

- Goodwill Industries had 7 defined outcome goals and achieved or exceeded 100% in 3 of these. Goodwill Industries reached 96% of the fourth outcome goal and 70% with the remaining three.
- The program did achieve its goal of developing a thorough and impactful accessibility plan for the agency. This plan was utilized agency-wide to evaluate and assess accessibility throughout our business operation and was eventually adopted as part of the agency plan.
- Although Goodwill did not quite reach 100%, Goodwill was able to reach 96% of our goal for the number of systems donated and refurbished. It took Goodwill a couple of months to develop and fine tune the talking points and outreach strategy to increase donations and raise awareness with other non-profits about our refurbished computers. Secondly, it took Goodwill a couple months to implement our first A+ IT Technician internship opportunities which increased our resource capacity for refurbishing computers.

Delineation of Deliverables and Outcomes Not Achieved and Explanation

- The program did not achieve its goal of placing a total of 68 students into employment. Instead, only 46 students successfully gained employment at the end of the training program. In our judgment, given the impact the economy had on the job market during the course of grant period, our grant goal was unattainable. More problematic for us, however, was the completion rate of students. For a variety of reasons, a number of our students were unable to complete the course work for each of our training programs. In particular, students typically struggled to maintain the basic resources necessary for shelter and food. Without those basic resources, they struggled with being able to attend classes.
- Another factor in the lower completion rate was our initial lack of sophisticated enrollment tools. Initially, Goodwill was enrolling just about anyone who was interested into the program. As a result, Goodwill enrolled many students with questionable commitments to digital literacy and the technical training. Many of these students did not follow through with their commitment to the training program, which in turn, negatively impacted our completion rate. As learned, Goodwill continued to fine tune and improve the enrollment process.

Discussion of Other Positive Results from Project

A major output of this project has been ability for Goodwill to embed technical training into the e-waste business operations. As a result of this grant, Goodwill was able to build a training center right into the e-waste operations warehouse which allowed us to provide classroom and contextualized learning opportunities to program participants, staff and community.

This allowed us to not only coordinate but also improve our business, environmental and training operations. The ReCompute program was a perfect demonstration of the mission of Goodwill while allowing us to develop a much needed learning space for low income residents of San Mateo County. This new venture created many new opportunities for Goodwill and the community, including:

1. Goodwill's ReCompute program was nominated and selected as the "2010 Sustainable Program of the Year" by Sustainable San Mateo County. Sustainable San Mateo County is the foremost sustainability advocacy non-profit in San Mateo County.
2. Goodwill's ReCompute program was included in San Mateo County Human Service Agency's application to create a Green Job Corps for Youth. This program, founded by former Governor Arnold Schwarzenegger, combined green job preparation and environmental literacy with real work experience. Goodwill's part of this program was to enroll 33 young adults into the IT Technician training program as well as offer a paid internship within ReCompute. The internship experience provided the students with hands on experience

working to divert e-waste from the landfill and repurposing technology for use by low-income members in their communities.

3. CETF provided Goodwill with the financial resources to develop a robust paid internship program to coincide with the IT Technician training program. This paid internship program allowed Goodwill to change the conversation with employers. By providing a wage subsidy, a wide range of employers came to the table willing to participate in the program. While some employers were interested in aligning with Goodwill's mission, the vast majority were focused on their bottom line. The wage subsidy was enough of an incentive to allow "bottom line" employers to partner with us and get Goodwill and our participants in the door, and opportunities for stable employment. As a result, Goodwill has established and expanded lasting partnerships with a wide variety of employers who continue to host our interns and hire our graduates.

Overview of Major Challenges to Achieving Planned Results

Identify Major Challenges to Successful Implementation

Goodwill Industries faced one major challenge during the grant period relating directly to the job market:

- The goal was to place 75% of our program graduates into unsubsidized employment at the end of their training. Unfortunately, the program launched at the end of 2008, right as the impact of the financial and real estate crash were just beginning to be felt. Goodwill's target population for job training is primarily low income, underserved and undereducated members of our community, who even in a strong economy, face significant barriers to employment. With the financial crisis sending unemployment rates to levels not seen since 1980, our graduates entered a job market where they were competing with skilled, experienced workers for a scarce number of entry level opportunities.

Discuss Efforts to Address Challenges and Resolve Problems

Goodwill's response to this reality was two-fold:

- It focused on creating lasting relationships with small to mid-size local employers through our internship program. This connection created employment opportunities for our graduates who were able to prove their ability and leverage their relationships with decision-makers in each company. Interns were able to gain access to interviews and jobs in a much less competitive way than a standard online application and resume submission.
- Goodwill realized that with a decreased job market Goodwill needed to create alternative "next steps" for our graduates. While participating in the Green Job Corps partnership, Goodwill developed a relationship with Skyline Community College and discovered the opportunity to articulate our digital literacy programs for transferable college credit. Through the California Community College Chancellor's Office's "Tech Prep" program, Goodwill program graduates were eligible for up to 6 units of transferable college credit upon completion of our training programs. Several graduates who were unable to obtain employment utilized this program to gain stackable units and continued to pursue academic learning after leaving Goodwill. This is an alternative for a successful "next step" for program graduates.

V. Lessons and Recommendations

Summary of Lessons Learned

Lesson #1: Goodwill needs to give careful thought to the kind of student the program is best suited to serve. In our effort, given a great deal of pressure to meet numerical goals, Goodwill enrolled students whose academic skills were not sufficient to earn the A+/IC3 in the amount of time allotted by the program. Going forward Goodwill needs to consider the time required to reach our goals considering the diverse challenges facing Goodwill's target population.

Lesson #2: Goodwill will include academic achievement as an alternative positive outcome to job placement. While Goodwill strive to help low income, undeserved and undereducated individuals pursue and obtain employment, Goodwill need to acknowledge the need for our program graduates to pursue an education. For many program graduates, completing the Goodwill training program is the first-time they have graduated from any academic program in an adult setting. Graduates are not only prepared for a job, but prepared to be a life-long student. The wages that participants need to support themselves and their family does not exist at the entry level work they are qualified for upon completion of the program. If academic achievement is included as a positive outcome, grantees may focus more efforts on preparing our graduates not only for work, but also for continued academic growth as they pursue a sustainable career.

Recommendations

Recommendations for Expanding the Project in Region or Scaling Up Statewide

Recommendation #1: While statistics show that CETF has been extremely effective in helping communities bridge the digital divide, the work to provide true digital literacy is just beginning. Goodwill has learned that digital literacy is desperately needed at all levels throughout our agency and with the community at large. As technology continues to evolve and change, digital literacy is even more crucial in the workplace. Organizations at all levels need solutions to effectively and efficiently train their members on an ongoing basis. Helping people become digitally literate provides them with the tools they need to be successful. This essential work needs to continue to be scaled throughout California.

Recommendation #2: Goodwill also recommend continuing advocacy for low-cost solutions to broadband and mobile technology. The power of technology is only as useful as the tools you have to harness it. For the vast majority of our program participants and staff, budgeting for and affording technology tools still remain out of reach. Goodwill recommends that the work continue on the statewide level to advocate for lower price points and subsidies for low income members of our community to access technology.

Recommendations to CETF Regarding Grants Management

Recommendation #1: The grants management relationship between CETF and Goodwill has been exceptionally smooth and efficient. Goodwill is completely satisfied with the relationship.

VI. Grant Agreement Requirements

Purchased Equipment

The project purchased a total of \$18,455 in computers and related equipment to offer wireless connectivity and 4 additional workstations in the media lab.

Date	Description	Purpose	Amount	State how it will be used.
June 2008	20 Desktop Computers, Monitors & Peripherals for Redwood City Classroom	Classroom Instruction	\$17,600	The computers will continue to be used for digital literacy classroom instruction.
January 2011	Portion of laptop cart, printer, and peripherals	To expand digital literacy offering in San Francisco	\$855	To continue to support Goodwill's expanding digital literacy offerings.

CETF Balance of Grant Funds

All of the CETF grants funds were expended.